

EFFECTIVENESS OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF JOB ENLARGEMENT AND JOB ENRICHMENT METHODS TO OVERCOME LIMITED NUMBER OF EMPLOYEES

Dewi Kurniawati¹, Nyoman Anita Damayanti^{1*}

¹Department of Health Policy and Administration, Faculty of Public Health, Universitas
Airlangga, Surabaya-60115, Indonesia

*Corresponding Author: Nyoman Anita Damayanti, Department of Health Policy and
Administration, Faculty of Public Health, Universitas Airlangga, Campus C UNAIR Jl Dr. Ir.
H. Soekarno, Surabaya-60115, East Java, Indonesia
Email: nyoman.ad@fkm.unair.ac.id

Abstract

Background: Professional governance is currently the biggest demand of the community. However, this is problematic because people still have to deal with limited numbers and unequal distribution of employees in one particular work unit. This is not to mention the designation of employees who are not compatible with the needs of each government organization. Workload analysis can be used to find out what positions employee shortages or employee overload have. Recruitment can be arranged to resolve the problem of employee shortages. However, if an organization has not been able to increase the number of its employees shortly, then a possible alternative is to rearrange job designation by implementing job enlargement and job enrichment. **Purpose:** This study aims to find out the effectiveness of policies in overcoming the limited number of employees. **Methods:** This was a descriptive study that aimed to see the effectiveness of the variables studied using descriptive analysis of the results of employee performance appraisal before and after job enlargement and job enrichment implemented. **Results:** Job enlargement and job enrichment are fairly effective to carry out as an alternative in overcoming the limited number of employees. **Conclusion:** This is concluded from the absence of a decrease in the results of employee performance appraisal. Some of them even increased despite the addition of responsibilities.

Keywords: *job enlargement, job enrichment, , limited number of employees, performance, workload analysis*

1. INTRODUCTION

Efficient and effective governance is needed in this globalization era to keep up with real competitions and limitations in all fields. This requires the professionalism of the personnel of government affairs. This is in accordance with Law No. 43 of 1999 concerning the main

points of staffing, which states that as an element of state personnel, civil servants must provide services to the community in a professional manner (1).

One of the reasons why we have not achieved professional public service is the limited number of employees and the unequal distribution of employees in work units. Moreover, the incompatible designation of positions with the actual needs of an organization, in the sense that they are not based on existing workloads. This causes an overload of employees in one work unit and a lack of employees in other work units.

Employees are one of the main assets of the organization, which plays the role of active planners and actors of each organization's activities. They have thoughts, feelings, desires, status, and educational backgrounds, age, and gender that bring diversity into the organization. The quality and quantity of human resources must be in accordance with the needs of the organization in order to effectively and efficiently support the achievement of goals (2).

Human resource strategy, which in this case can be interpreted as employee planning, is the main function that must be carried out by each organization and must be the focus of attention to ensure that the steps taken by management are effective and can occupy the right position for achieving various goals and targets that have been set.

Therefore, to overcome the problem of a limited number of employees and a lack of equal distribution of employees, it is necessary to improve and reorganize staffing management in a better direction and in a clearer pattern to make it sustainable. One component that is urgent to improve is the formation of employees in accordance with the vision, mission, goals, and objectives of the organization, as well as their main functions and duties. This is to ensure that it meets the needs of the organization in a professional, effective, and efficient manner. Thus, the calculation of workload analysis is very important to carry out in order to find out what positions are experiencing employee shortages or employee overloads (3).

Recruitment can be arranged as an alternative to solving the problem of employee shortages. However, if an organization has not been able to increase the number of its employees shortly, then a possible alternative that can be done is to rearrange job designations by implementing job enlargement and job enrichment (4).

Job enlargement or job enrichment is still a dilemma for some organizations. Some employee organizations are still opposed to its implementation because for them, it is just

another way to increase employee workload. Whereas on the other hand, job enlargement and job enrichment can be good solutions for employees and the organization itself (1,5).

Therefore, this study aims to determine the effectiveness of the implementation of job enlargement and job enrichment to overcome the limited number of employees, which will be associated with the performance of the employees.

2. METHODS

This research was a descriptive study, which analyzed the system for managing employee needs. The research location was in the Public Health Office of Kediri City. The data used were secondary data from the Public Health Office of Kediri City. This compared the analysis of data about the needs and availability of personnel with the results of an employee performance appraisal in the Public Health Office of Kediri City.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Human Resources Strategy at the Kediri City Public Health Office

In the 2014-2019 Health Strategic Plan (Renstra) of Kediri City, the following items were listed:

Vision: Planning the City of Kediri to Become More Prosperous, Just, Competitive, Moral, and Free from Corruption

First Mission: Realizing a clean, transparent, accountable, effective, and efficient governance by encouraging public participation in the development

Performance Indicator: Increased accountability of local government performance and increased public service excellence for the community

To support the above items, comprehensive HR planning was necessary to carry out in order to get the optimal program implementers and service providers to the community. HR planning could be done by conducting a Workload Analysis (ABK). The Workload Analysis (ABK) results showed that there was still a gap between the needs and availability of workers in the Public Health Office of Kediri City. The need was greater than the availability, so it required a recruitment proposal for additional personnel. However, because the moratorium was still ongoing, the recruitment process could not yet be carried out. Thus, an alternative must be implemented, including job enlargement and job enrichment methods.

Analysis of Human Resources Needs and Availability in the Public Health Office of Kediri City

The results of the analysis using Form D included the calculation of employee needs and the number of employees in the Public Health Office of Kediri City, and the assessment of the Effectiveness of Job Position and Performance in the Public Health Office of Kediri City. The results of the analysis conducted using Effective Hours of Work for 1,300 hours per year/person based on Permendagri No. 12 of 2008 showed that the level of effectiveness of the position in the Public Health Office of Kediri City was 1.06.27, which indicated that its performance was in A category or "Very Good". This category included positions that were evenly categorized as (A), (C), and (E). The (E) position was listed as "Less", and those positions were: Drivers, Managers of Realization of Regional Retribution Receipt Reports, Cleaning Staff, Administrators of Warehouse Pharmacy, Ambulance Drivers, and Data Verifier. This lowest value (E) was largely due to the limited number of civil servants (PNS) in these positions, so it should be noted that the distribution of workload in the Public Health Office of Kediri City was not balanced. To deal with the limited number of employees in these positions, it is recommended to carry out job enlargement and job enrichment (6,7).

Overview of Implementation of Job Enlargement and Job Enrichment

The implementation of job enlargement at the Public Health Office of Kediri City was a regional inventory manager assigned additionally as a driver, a mail administrator assigned additionally as a receptionist, and a medical record officer assigned additionally as a manager for the realization of regional retribution receipt reports, and many others.

Job enrichment was carried out in addition to job enlargement (8). The implementation included extension workers who were given additional authority to design, manage, and even innovate to achieve the objectives of the program for which they were in charge for, or a health worker (midwife) assigned additionally as data verifier, program planner and evaluator of activities in the field of Maternal and Child Health (MCH).

Analysis of Employee Performance Appraisal Results

The performance of civil servants in the Public Health Office of Kediri City followed the level of success or achievement of the program/activity implementation that had been determined in relation to its duties and functions. Evaluations/assessments are observed based on several performance indicators including Productivity, Service Quality, Responsiveness,

Responsibility, and Accountability (9). The appraisal process was done through interviews, customer satisfaction surveys, and observations.

Table 1. Performance Appraisal Results of Public Health Office of Kediri City in 2014

Appraisal aspect	Result
Productivity	The programs and activities specified for each section were carried out according to the plan.
Quality of Service	The services run well according to the needs of the community: (1) Employees carried out their duties carefully, accurately, and accountably according to the needs of the community; (2) Employees in charge did not discriminate against the community when providing services.
Responsibility	Public services at the Public Health Office were quite good, especially those relating to the ability of employees to provide services to the community. However, there were still a number of obstacles, including licensing that takes a long time to complete (longer than the duration stated in the SOP).
Responsiveness	The implementation of services based on their duties and functions was optimal.
Accountability	The accountability systems for carrying out duties, activities, and services to the community were often tardy and did not meet the standard.

Table 1 shows the results of employee performance appraisals before the implementation of job enlargement and job enrichment. Some employees still continued to carry out job descriptions based on their initial position and educational background. The shortage of employees still required the recruitment process (CPNS, PTT, and contract workers opening).

Table 2. Performance Appraisal Results of Public Health Office of Kediri City in 2017

Appraisal aspect	Result
Productivity	The programs and activities specified for each section were carried out according to the plan and with a number of additional innovations to support the realization of the specified program.
Quality of Service	The services run well according to the needs of the community: (1) Employees carried out their duties carefully, accurately, and accountably according to the needs of the community; (2) Employees in charge provided services in a transparent, simple, and easily accessible manner, with a comprehensive explanation; (3) Employees in charge did not discriminate against the community and prioritize fairness when providing services.
Responsibility	The public services at the Public Health Office were running well, especially those relating to the ability of employees to provide services to the community. It was in accordance with the SOP for each section.
Responsiveness	The implementation of services based on their duties and functions was optimal.
Accountability	The accountability systems for carrying out duties, activities, and services to the community were in accordance with standards and on time, even got praise from the city government.

Table 2 presents the results of employee performance appraisal after implementing job enlargement and job enrichment for three years. The appraisal results indicated that no decrease in the results of employee performance appraisals was found during the implementation of the two alternatives. Even, some appraisal results showed an increase, but not significant.

Analysis of the Effectiveness of Job Enlargement and Job Enrichment Methods to Overcome the Limited Number of Employees

The analysis of the needs and availability of personnel in the Public Health Office of Kediri City was compared to the results of the performance appraisal of employees in the Public Health Office of Kediri City. The comparisons showed that job enlargement and job enrichment were quite effective to overcome a limited number of employees (10). This was

reinforced by the absence of a decrease in performance appraisal results of employees during the implementation of the two alternatives. Even, some appraisal results showed an increase, and significant.

The analysis results of the needs and availability of workers in the Public Health Office of Kediri City indicated that the number of employees needed was greater than the number of available employees. This was because there was no recruitment from CPNS (moratorium policy) from 2014 to 2018.

During this period, the fulfillment of labor was done through work expansion (job enlargement) and increased responsibilities (job enrichment). For example, the existing health workers (midwives) were given authority or more responsibility to verify data, become program planners and evaluators of activities in the field of MCH. The job was initially expected to be carried out by at least two adapters, but actually could be completed by only one person and they could get satisfaction in doing so (example of job enrichment). Another example was a medical record officer who was assigned to a higher responsibility as the manager of the realization of the regional retribution receipt reports. So, it was not only their responsibilities increasing in their fields, but also in other fields (example of job enlargement).

Therefore, an assessment of the policy system is needed to check whether the policy is still effective enough to overcome the existing problems. The assessment is done by comparing the results of employee performance appraisals before and after job enlargement and job enrichment.

4. CONCLUSION

The results of this study indicated that during the job enlargement and job enrichment, there is no decrease in employee performance appraisal results. Even, some of the results of employee performance appraisals show improvement despite additional duties and responsibilities. It can be concluded that job enlargement and job enrichment are still quite effective to overcome the problem of a limited number of employees in the Public Health Office of Kediri City.

References

1. Lumentah JG, Posumah JH, Ogotan M. Evaluasi Kinerja Pegawai Negeri Sipil Dalam

- Meningkatkan Pelayanan Publik Di Kantor Camat Tompaso Kabupaten Minahasa. *J Adm PUBLIK*. 2015;3(031).
2. Hasibuan MSP. *Manajemen sumber daya manusia edisi revisi*. Bumi Aksara, Jakarta. 2005;288.
 3. Dessler G. *Human resource management* Pearson Prentice Hall. 2005;
 4. Gomez-Mejia LR, Balkin DB, Cardy RL. *Managing Human Resource* Prentice Hall. Up Saddle River, NJ. 2004;
 5. Saleem S, Shaheen WA, Saleem R. The impact of job enrichment and job enlargement on employee satisfaction keeping employee performance as intervening variable: a correlational study from Pakistan. *Kuwait Chapter Arab J Bus Manag Rev*. 2012;1(9):145.
 6. Greenberg J, Baron RA. *Behavior in organization Edisi Kedelapan*. New Jersey: Pearson Education. Inc; 2003.
 7. Griffin RW, Moorhead G. *Organizational behavior*. Nelson Education; 2011.
 8. Raza MA, Nawaz MM. Impact of job enlargement on employees' job satisfaction, motivation and organizational commitment: Evidence from public sector of Pakistan. *Int J Bus Soc Sci*. 2011;2(18).
 9. Marinova S V, Peng C, Lorinkova N, Van Dyne L, Chiaburu D. Change-oriented behavior: A meta-analysis of individual and job design predictors. *J Vocat Behav*. 2015;88:104–20.
 10. Bettini EA, Cheyney K, Wang J, Leko C. Job design: An administrator's guide to supporting and retaining special educators. *Interv Sch Clin*. 2015;50(4):221–5.